Interactions between Travel Narratives and Short Fiction: Stories Revolving around St. Patrick's Purgatory, 1827-1843

NAKAMURA Tetsuko

1. Short Stories, Travelogue and Irish Heritage Sites

In his classic study of the short story form, *The Lonely Voice*, Frank O'Connor notes the success of Irish short stories as compared with the success of English novels: "On the other hand my own country, which had failed to produce a single novelist, had produced four or five storytellers who seemed to me to be first-rate" (19). As O'Connor indicates, Irish short stories have established a solid reputation in the modern literary tradition. One of the earliest academic monographs on the history of British and Irish short stories, written by Harold Orel, notably begins its analyses with an Ireland-based Irish writer William Carleton (1794–1869). Orel sees Carleton as a writer who "represents a critical moment in the history of an emerging awareness" (14). Carleton persevered to convey the truth about the Irish peasantry through his expository stories. Eschewing both the Irish oral tradition and formal English prose, he trailblazed his own fusion of fact and fiction to portray the realities of peasant life to British readers. Carleton's insistence on supplying authentic details has also been pointed out by Heather Ingman in her work on the history of Irish short stories. She attributes Carleton's unceasing revisions of his stories to his uncertainty about how to maintain a balance between fictional narrative and factual reporting (36–37).

The short stories discussed herein are clearly different in quality from modern short stories — a "modern art form" in O'Connor's terms (13) — which are usually regarded as those produced after the 1880s, as far as Britain and Ireland are concerned. In the 1880s, literary culture, spurred on by technological developments and a resultant expanded readership, saw a boost in the production and recognition

This is a revised and expanded version of a paper entitled "Promoting Irishness: Interactions between Travel Narratives and Short Fiction in the 1820s and 1830s", which was delivered on November 16, 2012, at the Conference "The Irish Short Story" held at Catholic University of Leuven, Belgium (November 15-17, 2012). This research is supported by JSPS KAKENHI Grant Number 23520330.

of short stories, which developed into "a discrete type of text" (Malcolm and Malcolm 9), i.e. one that is structurally tight and narrated from a focused point of view. However, in the 1820s and 1830s, when Carleton was starting his career, various types of short narrative were produced, and Tim Killick consciously uses "short fiction," rather than "short stories," to refer to this literary form (10). A variety of terms such as "tales," "sketches," "legends," "essays," and "stories" are employed in the titles, and this "hybrid mix of travelogue, memoirs, sketches, tales and legends", in Ingman's words (16), provided the foundation on which the short-story genre evolved in the nineteenth century.

In this context, the process of literary interaction leading to the creation of Carleton's debut story "A Pilgrimage to Patrick's Purgatory" (1828) and the later revised versions of the story provide a suggestive insight into the earlier development of the short-story genre. St. Patrick's Purgatory on Station Island in Lough Derg, Donegal attracted an annual average of 10,000 pilgrims in the early nineteenth century (Turner and Turner 258). Both Carleton and his literary mentor Caesar Otway (1780–1842) tried to make their travel narratives about this ancient Catholic pilgrimage site appealing to British readers.

In the 1820s, after two decades of general sluggishness after the Union, Ireland witnessed a variety of social and cultural changes. Increased attention was paid to the position of Irish Catholics in Britain, and the Catholic Emancipation Act was eventually passed in 1829. Also, the antiquarian enthusiasm that had bubbled up over James Macpherson's Ossian poems in the previous century was gradually regenerated in Ireland; both Anglo-Irish- and Catholic-oriented bodies, such as the Royal Irish Academy and the Gaelic Society, renewed their activities (O'Halloran 616–17). This growing antiquarian and archaeological interest was associated with an expansion of travel pursuits, which interacted with the gradually expanding publications of topographical and travel guides and personal travel narratives (Hooper 101–07), along with paintings and book illustrations featuring landscapes studded with ruins and cottiers (Dunn 79–82). British interest in Catholic and Gaelic Ireland, mixed with condescending pity and nostalgic yearning, was entering on a new phase.

It was at this time that the Catholic-born Protestant Carleton started his literary career and the so-called super-Protestant Otway experimented with literary activities, involving himself deeply in magazine publishing. This medium played a vital role in the creation of short fiction throughout Britain (Killick 22–37), and focusing on these two Ireland-based writers reveals a significant aspect of the interactive relationship between travelogues, myths and legends, and short stories in the Irish context. It sheds further light on the complicated literary network of narrative which

led to the formation of the "short story."

2. Caesar Otway as an Objective-Narrator

Carleton, who is best known for his series *Traits and Stories of the Irish Peasantry* (published from 1830 onwards), was the son of a Catholic peasant in Tyrone and was educated in hedge schools. He later converted to Protestantism and, finally settling down in Dublin, developed his literary expertise as a protégé of Otway, a priest of the Church of Ireland. Carleton started writing stories from an anti-papist point of view for the *Christian Examiner and Church of Ireland Magazine*, founded by Otway in 1825. Carleton's maiden work "A Pilgrimage to Patrick's Purgatory" appeared in the April and the May issues of the 1828 *Christian Examiner* and also in a one-volume book entitled "The Lough Dearg Pilgrim" together with "Father Butler" (1829 and 1839); finally, it was included as "The Lough Derg Pilgrim" in the first volume of his definitive edition of *Traits and Stories* (1843–44). Carleton was requested to write on this topic by Otway (Carleton, "The Lough" 236–37; [Otway] "Caesar Otway" 21), who had already traveled around Donegal and visited St. Patrick's Purgatory in the late summer of 1822. In 1827, Otway published a travel narrative about the Donegal tour under the title *Sketches in Ireland*, which also includes descriptions of his tour around Munster in 1826. Carleton's work itself deals with his own pilgrimage to the sacred site at the age of nineteen. This narrative, framed as a travelogue, was thus triggered by Otway's own travels and his travelogue.

Otway's narrative on the Donegal tour consists of four letters addressed to a clergyman of his acquaintance, following a contemporary convention whereby travel narratives were composed of a series of letters supposed to have been sent by the traveler. Otway's visit to St. Patrick's Purgatory occupies the final letter, which ends with a recommendation to visit the areas he traveled to, including Station Island: "if you do not like the information and amusement I have placed before you, . . . go and see for yourselves" (200). As suggested in this last sentence, Otway not only provides factual descriptions of his travels, but also introduces various anecdotal stories into the letters. In the final letter, there are two sections beginning with capital letters that immediately capture the reader's attention: "THE FOLLOWING IS EXTRACTED FROM BISHOP HENRY JONES'S ACOUNT, PUBLISHED 1647" (156); and "THE HISTORY OF A SPANISH VISCOUNT" (161). The former four-page section appears to be made up simply of quotations from Jones's 1647 publication, *Saint Patricks Purgatory*. They provide geographical information about the site, mainly explaining the arrangement of the various facilities, and describe the pilgrims'

accommodation in those days. My research has made it clear that there are great discrepancies between the quotations and Jones's original in terms of wording and how the clauses are connected (because of Otway's use of contractions), which raises doubts about how closely Otway referred to Jones's 1647 publication, which had never been republished in book form. However, it is quite possible that Otway freely based his version on Jones's text, although he might just have used some excerpts that were readily available. As quoted by Otway, the text sounds more natural and must have been easier for his contemporaries to read.

The second ten-page section describes the penitential practices of Raimundo Perellós, Viscount of Perellós and Rueda of the Kingdom of Aragon, who was active between the end of the fourteenth century and the middle of the fifteenth century. He made a pilgrimage to St. Patrick's Purgatory in 1397, mourning the death of John I of Aragon, whom he served. Otway introduces his narrative as "a tale . . . delivered by Phil O'Sullivan, in his Historia Catholica Hibernicae," which was published in Lisbon in 1621 (160). Philip O'Sullivan (c. 1590–1660), a nephew of the last Gaelic Prince of Beare, Munster and an active Spanish soldier, recorded in Latin the Viscount's first-person Catalan narrative. Otway includes this medieval visionary story, depending largely on quotations from an English translation and linking them with his own summaries to convey the essence of Raimundo's agonizing and tormenting experiences in St. Patrick's Purgatory. Since Otway does not provide any information about the English translation he quotes from, the reader gets the impression that Otway referred either to an English resource or to the original *Historiae Catholicae Iberniae Compendium* to produce his own translation. But in fact, Jones's *Saint Patricks Purgatory* includes an English version of O'Sullivan's writing, and my research reveals the discrepancies between Otway's citations and the versions in Jones's publication; however, the inclusion of an English translation of O'Sullivan's work in Jones's volume leads to the conclusion that Otway was unlikely to have produced his own English version of the original Latin text, which was not available in book form until 1850.[1] It can be inferred that Otway depended on rather limited sources, in spite of the contrary impression he creates in his narrative.

That Otway was keen to mention various sources in his narrative is also supported by the passage below, which connects the two sections referred to above. The quotation it contains, attributed to St Caesarius of Arles, was taken from the English translation of Geoffrey Keating's *Foras Feasa ar Éirinn* (*The General History of Ireland*), which was first published in 1723:

[1] The 1850 volume of O'Sullevano Bearro's *Historiae* was edited by Kelly.

> This Purgatory, with all its superstitions is very ancient. — Caesarius (quoted by Keating) who lived 500 years, (says mine author,) after Christ, asserts "whoever doubts whether there be such a place as purgatory, let him go to Scotia — let him enter into the Purgatory of St. Patrick, and he will no longer doubt the pains of purgatory." (160)

The quotation included in the above text is basically the same as that in the 1723 volume; this translation of Keating's highly regarded history of Ireland was repeatedly published in the eighteenth century and also in 1809 and 1817 in Ireland.[2] Thus referring to different sources, Otway accommodates historical and antiquarian interest and emphasizes the long tradition of St. Patrick's Purgatory, whose popularity spread throughout Europe.

Prior to this series of historical references and descriptions, Otway also provides a quote from a contemporary account of the Purgatory, saying "I shall . . . give an account of its modern state as recorded by an eye witness" (155). Although he does not refer to the source of this citation, my research indicates that it is a quote from a short communication written by B. D. and included in the first issue of a short-lived magazine called the *Roman Catholic Expositor, and Friend of Ireland*, published in Dublin in 1825. Otway, employing an anonymously quoted passage on the current state of the Purgatory, introduces the site as something already familiar to the reader, and then incorporates antiquarian references and eventually the Viscount's medieval purgatory narrative. Skillfully linking different sources, Otway provides factual descriptions of the holy place and its history, followed by descriptions which must have seemed incredible and fictional at the time. This arrangement would have helped some readers feel a smooth and natural shift in the narrative quality, giving them a sense of verisimilitude in the narrative. Other readers on the other hand would have seen the stark contrast between fact and fiction, finding the Viscount's experiences somewhat unbelievable or even ridiculous. As a descendant of an Anglo-Irish Protestant family and an anti-Papist clergyman, Otway carefully controls his role as an objective observer-narrator by deliberately referring to a variety of antiquarian information and writing, and maintaining his role as a traveler (and not as a Christian) who pays attention to the historical and antiquarian significance of the religious site.

Otway's objective attitude is also witnessed in the description of the Viscount's experiences. Otway starts the section as a first-person narrative with a quote: "I Ramon, by the grace of God, Viscount of Perels, Baron of Lereta, was a follower of

---

[2] *The General History of Ireland* was published at least nine times in the eighteenth century.

Charles King of France; and in his court I did hear persons discoursing of strange things, especially what concerned Patrick's Purgatory" (161). However, the Viscount's journey to St. Patrick's Purgatory is summarized by Otway and, in the succeeding section, Otway uses quotations and his own linking passages to describe the Viscount's experiences in the "cave," a sacred space associated with St. Patrick, where pilgrims experienced purgatorial torments.[3]

In the original text, Ramon describes his progress through about ten stages of torturous trials, from a field in which people are bound to the ground and bitten by fiery dragons and a well of fire from which the raging flames engulf people, to a narrow bridge high over a freezing river which might be blown away in a terrible storm at any moment.[4] This pilgrim's purgatory quest follows the tradition rooted in the prototypical *Tractatus de Purgatorio Sancti Patricii*, the most influential text on St. Patrick's Purgatory, produced around 1200 (Easting lxxxiv–xc; Le Goff 194–97; Matsuda 47). The series of fearful descriptions of infernal torture was originally vital in persuading Christians to do penance; however, Otway briefly summarizes the dreadful depictions of the Purgatory, saying "with a prolixity which we have no desire to copy, he [the Viscount] describes his passage through the second, third, and fourth fields of torment, all in safety" (166–67). The only passage Otway quotes from the English version concerns the frozen river:

> Being astonished with the terribleness of the punishment, I was along with my attendant devils, driven by a high wind over a huge mountain, and cast into a great river, extremely cold, and distressingly stinking, where many were tormented, who, once on earth sat in warm palaces, in the midst of perfumes and odorous frankincense, and civet; but now were tormented with frigorific shiverings, and with smells intensely detestable. (167–68)

The torture described in this section is the least grotesque in all of the stages of purgatory. By suppressing the more fearful details of the purgatory quest, Otway's appears to want to avoid frightening the reader and also to reduce the homiletic tone while maintaining his stance as an objective traveler to this religious site. Otway steers the reader away from the religious realm of Station Island by setting this essentially visionary story within the framework of travel writing.

---

[3] For information about the difficulties surrounding the identification of the cave, see Skeffington (175–76).

[4] The structure of this narrative is shared by Henry Jones's 1647 English version and Raimundo Perellós's original version (Mac an Bhaird).

Closing this part of the Viscount's narrative, Otway uses O'Sullivan's voice to show his own skeptical attitude to the Viscount's experiences: "If this history of the Viscount seem in any thing difficult to believe, let him who desireth to be satisfied, read Dionysius Carthasianus, his work of the four last days, where he more at large prosecutes the subject, and resolve all doubts and difficulties" (170). This passage is followed by Otway's own explanation of the historical closing of the Purgatory by Pope Alexander VI in 1497: "the Pope ordered it [the Purgatory] to be destroyed as a filthy nest of superstition and of evil deeds" (170). This sarcastic remark made in the name of Pope confirms the distance Otway wishes to keep from St. Patrick's Purgatory, despite the fact that he deems it worth visiting in his travelogue.

3. Caesar Otway's Promotion of Irishness

In spite of, or perhaps because of, his efforts to maintain a role as an observer-narrator, Otway's inclination for storytelling is evident. His attachment to it is fully demonstrated by his inclusion of a Gaelic mythological narrative on Finn McCool toward the end of the same letter, after the purgatory description.

After landing by boat from Station Island, Otway had the opportunity to listen to a story about why the lake is called Lough Derg, which means Red Lake in Irish. Otway starts relating a story told by an uneducated Irish boy accompanying Otway as his guide: "mind here, reader, I pray you, that my memory does not serve me to give the following story exactly in the boy's words" (181). Thus, the story of Finn McCool casually but smoothly enters the travelogue as a legend firmly rooted in the oral tradition of the region. The narrative deals with Finn, who is ordered by King Niall to dispose of a wicked witch called the Hag with the Finger, who has one long finger on each hand; Finn finds her on a hill in East Munster and pierces her heart with a silver arrow as she tries to escape on the back of her monster son. When the "stupid giant" son reaches the mountains of Donegal (183), he realizes that all that remains of his mother is her shanks and a few other body parts, which he leaves behind and runs away. Later, a red worm lying on the Hag's thigh bone metamorphoses into a fierce, gigantic beast with the help of some lake water, into the stomach of which Finn jumps and carves a hole to save those the beast had swallowed alive. The beast's blood turns the lake red, and eventually St. Patrick arrives to confine the beast to the bottom of the lake. The derivation of the name Lough Derg is thus explained, but Otway sarcastically compares the pain the beast underwent to "purgatorial agony" to provide a connection between this legendary story and the previous purgatory stories (191).

This version of the Finn story is one of many related to Lough Derg. W. Y. Evans Wentz provides one that was handed down locally until the early twentieth century, in which the "stupid giant" son carrying his mother is Finn himself; he is pursued by the Fenians, and the one who fights the serpent-like creature is not Finn but St. Patrick. Wentz adds a parallel episode concerning Galway Bay, referring to J. G. Campbell's nineteenth-century collection of serpent-slayer myths (442–45). All of these versions, in which Finn compares unfavorably with St. Patrick, convey a different impression from Otway's, which lays emphasis on Finn's strength and daring as a hero. It is true that in popular tradition both St. Patrick and Finn are depicted as snake slayers (McKillop 59–60), but Otway apparently prefers Finn as the epitome of a brave warrior. Otway in fact adds that he was told almost the same story near Croagh Patrick, another sacred pilgrimage site in honor of St. Patrick: "with little variation, it was repeated to me not long ago, at the foot of Croagh Patrick, while sitting on the edge of a cliff that overhangs the entrance into Clew Bay" (192). Finn and St. Patrick are thus geographically connected with the wild and remote region of Connacht.

In the sequel to this story, Croagh Patrick is further featured as the place where Finn finds the salmon of wisdom. Although this myth is commonly associated with the River Boyne and also the Assaroe Falls on the Erne estuary in Co. Donegal (MacKillop 20), in Otway's version King Cormac seeks a good place to find the salmon along the river which rises in the mountains around Croagh Patrick. Although I have been unable to find any written versions set in this area before this 1827 publication, Otway's version thereafter started to circulate in various different publications.

Otway's version is referred to as "a burlesque of the 'Salmon of Knowledge' story" by James MacKillop, because King Cormac competes with Finn to obtain the salmon of wisdom (21). In addition, the King voraciously eats the salmon he catches with the help of his Druid with the hope of gaining wisdom, which certainly adds a comical touch to the narrative. When both the King and the Druid become tired of eating salmon and therefore become more selective in their choice, they are unable to recognize the right salmon when they catch it. Otway mocks them: "ugly heads contain capacious brains, and sleek skins fail to enclose shining intellects" (197). Otway thus presents a negative depiction of the pagan king and prophet while predicting, at the end of the story, a bright future for Finn, who has been blessed with knowledge by sucking his thumb: "he felt as wise and prudent as if he was 100 years old — all his future glories — all the failures of his foes, and all his own achievements flashed before his eyes, and he saw prospectively how that Ireland and

Caledonia would ring with his fame, and both contend for the honor of giving him birth" (199). A boy wandering in the wild west of Ireland to hide from the men of Morna thus emerges as a future hero of both Ireland and Scotland. This shows that Otway was acutely aware of the Ossian controversy, which still lingered on in the early nineteenth century, when various writers in Ireland were claiming that the source of the Ossian poems was Irish, not Scottish (Leerssen 338–49; Ó Gallchoir 118–21; Trumpener 115–24).

Otway's portrayal of the Gaelic hero Finn as an Irish hero is reinforced with a long explanatory note appended to the scene where Finn fights the serpent-like monster. This six-paragraph note, considered to be Otway's original writing, focuses on Finn's great talents. Otway first praises the well-organized and trained Fianna warrior band (referring again to Keating) as a group which could rival the British Guards and those awarded the French Legion of Honour. He also admires Finn's great "poetical genius" and depicts him as a master of martial arts and as a great fighter and runner with amazing agility who lives on "beef and water" (188–89). The final paragraph again insists on the magnificence of the Fianna: "In a word it was the pride of the Fions that one of them could beat nine Englishmen or Scotchmen; and as an Englishman can certainly beat nine Frenchmen, so by legitimate consequence a Fion was an overmatch for eighty-one Gauls" (189). In claiming Finn as the Irish hero, Otway expresses his own nationalistic pride in Finn's superiority over the English, Scottish, and French. Otway's support of the Fenian Cycle's Irish Gaelic hero-legends can be viewed in connection with the Ossian controversy. In *Sketches in Ireland*, Finn is also referred to in passing as a symbolic figure: "his [an old man's] . . . acquaintance with legends about the *good people*, the Milesians, and Fin M'Coul" (212). Otway's positioning of himself as a member of the Irish community is brought to the fore through the stories of Finn, which contrasts with the observer-narrator attitude he adopts with respect to his Purgatory story.

The combination of Finn, St. Patrick, and Connaught in Otway's storytelling needs to be observed in connection with Thomas Crofton Croker, who drew enormous attention to Munster through his *Researches in the South of Ireland* (1824) and *Fairy Legends and Traditions of the South of Ireland* (1825–28), both published by John Murray. The former deals with Crofton's travels around Munster with two artists who provided illustrations for the book; this region-oriented publication satisfied British readers' antiquarian and literary interests. The latter book is a collection of local tales and legends, which gained immense popularity and made Croker famous. In *Sketches*, Otway expresses his sense of rivalry with Croker in a satirical tone (he himself was looking for opportunities to collect local tales during his

stay in Cork): "My dear fellow, will you to-morrow bring me to that man; I would pilgrimage over many of your hills to get into chat with him; for said I to myself, this is just the man that I want. And Crofton Croker shall not make all the Fairy legends of the South his own" (212–13). Otway was certainly interested in the local literary traditions. His inclusion of the Finn stories in his travelogue suggests that he wanted to offer something similar to Corker's Munster publications.

Interest in the local oral tradition had much to do with the growing desire in Britain to learn about unfamiliar aspects of Ireland. In his *Researches,* Croker remarks that Ireland is still "comparatively a terra incognita to the English in general" (1); he insists on the necessity of knowing about both the past and present of Ireland, referring to the Irish peasantry as a key to understanding the country (2). Travelogues about Ireland certainly played a vital role in providing descriptions of cottiers and the way they lived. In this context, *Letters from the Irish Highlands*, also published by Murray in 1825, is noted as the first publication focusing only on the Connemara area, and was well received by British readers. The Blake family, after they moved to Renvyle in this wild west region of Ireland, published *Letter* with the object of "removing the veil which conceals the real state of Ireland" and to offer details about the plebeian lives of its inhabitants to "the British public" (xx). The preface reveals a clear intention to make a strong impact on British readers by focusing on the Irish peasantry living in this remote area. The Blakes, with their long experience of living in England, knew what kind of Irishness British readers would appreciate, and this familial travel narrative represents one of the earliest region-oriented publications.

In *Sketches*, Dublin resident Otway does not show any acute awareness of the demands of English and Scottish readers. However, he declares: "as his [own] material so his manufacture should be Irish; and as Irishmen gave him entertainment, so they should receive from him employment" (iii); thus, Otway published this volume through William Curry of Dublin, drawing confidence from the fact that he was an Ireland-based writer, or from the fact that it was an Irish publication — or perhaps from both. The legends of Finn, passed down by local peasants over the centuries, were a good literary source on which Otway could rely to display his identity as an Irish writer.

Toward the end of the travelogue featuring St. Patrick's Purgatory, Otway narrates Finn's stories in his own words, fully developing the fictional realm of the north-west of Ireland without quoting from any sources, although he presents the stories through the mouths of Irish Catholics. This contrasts strongly with his narrative on Station Island, in which he confines himself to the information about this ancient site provided by various sources and simply reproduces information derived from

accounts of past pilgrimages. Thus, as a visiting Anglo-Irish Protestant clergyman, Otway displays an antiquarian approach, although he appears, according to my investigations, to have done less research than he tries to indicate in the narrative.

4. Carleton as a Short-Story Writer

Otway's efforts to direct wide attention to the north-west region by including religious and mythological legends in his travelogue eventually led to Carleton's debut as a peasant writer. Around the time when the first half of his "A Pilgrimage to Patrick's Purgatory" was published, Carleton had already been noted, along with the Banim brothers, as a new type of Irish fiction writer in a book review entitled "National Tales of Ireland" appearing in the *Westminster Review*: "their fellow-labourer in the same rough soil" ([Maurice] 430). Other reviews referring to the Banims and Gerald Griffin as well as Anglo-Irish novelists suggest the growing power of Irish novels and their great impact on the market for British novels ([Moore]; [Morgan]).[5] Featuring cottiers in his writing, Carleton began his literary career as interest in Irish literature focusing on common Irish people and their lives was growing.

"The Lough Derg Pilgrim" included in the definitive edition of *Traits and Stories of the Irish Peasantry* is the most widely available version of Carleton's story of his pilgrimage to St. Patrick's Purgatory. However, this is only the final version of the story: the first appeared in 1828 and underwent various revisions to reach this final version. Most of the first revisions for a book published together with "Father Butler" in 1829 were in the opening section; the 1839 edition of this publication added minor revisions, most of which were spelling and typographical changes (Hayley 341–44). Afterwards, when Carleton incorporated this story for the first time in *Traits and Stories* in 1843, he almost completely changed the opening section and extensively revised the rest of the story. Hayley suggests that Carleton needed to make this anti-Papist story less offensive to a wider readership for its inclusion in the popular series (344). The original version does indeed include various coarse criticisms of the Roman Catholic Church, which Carleton believed to be mired in dogmatic and superstitious customs and beliefs.

"A Pilgrimage to Patrick's Purgatory" begins with critical observations on the superstitions deeply embedded in the minds of Irish peasants. Carleton presents himself as someone uniquely positioned to depict the lives of Roman Catholic

[5] For details, see Nakamura (39-40).

peasants living under the influence of superstitions: "A man must be brought up among the Irish peasantry, and under the influence of superstition, before he can understand its form and character correctly" (268). Carleton continues the introduction for over five pages, describing his suffering as he was brought up in the Catholic faith under the strain of inner conflict over the nature and structure of the Catholic Church in Ireland. St. Patrick's Purgatory is introduced as an unrivalled example of Irish superstition. At the end of the section, Carleton states, "I commenced this paper with an intention of giving you an account of a pi[l]grimage which I made" (270), employing the expression "this paper" to introduce the main part of the writing on his pilgrimage experience. Starting with his own opinions on the Catholic Church, he gives the reader the impression that this magazine article is a piece of argumentative writing on Catholic faith in Ireland. This is also reinforced by the fact that it appears in the magazine's "Miscellaneous Communications" section.

Interestingly, this original introductory section, most of which appears in both the 1829 and 1839 versions, is completely replaced in the 1843 version by one which includes a rather long quotation from Otway's letter about his visit to Station Island in *Sketches*. Carleton cites both the details of Otway's travel from the gateway village Pettigo to the island, and also the same passage that Otway quoted from Jones's 1647 account of Station Island. In this 1843 introductory section, Carleton reveals that he produced the first version at the request of Otway, and recites part of his mentor's travelogue as if in tribute to Otway, who had died the previous year (Hayley 345–46). Carleton calls him "a true friend in every sense of the word" and adds a few words of gratitude: "In a literary point of view I am under the deepest obligations to his excellent judgment and good taste" (237). Carleton thus produced this version of the story of his own pilgrimage to St. Patrick's Purgatory in memory of Otway, in much the same ways as Raimundo Perellós made his pilgrimage to mourn John I of Aragon. Otway included a description of the Viscount's Purgatory experiences in his letter to show his own critical and skeptical attitude toward Catholic superstition, but Carleton neither cites this description nor makes any reference at all to the Viscount. Carleton thus avoids associating Otway's death with the superstitious realm of the Purgatory or with his own experiences in Station Island as presented in the main story.

To control the messages he wants to convey in this version, Carleton relies on the framework of travelogue. The introductory section allows him to appear as an objective traveler-guide so that he can objectively introduce the site and present the pilgrimage narrative; in the main narrative, the narrator becomes the young Catholic protagonist himself. Carleton draws a symbolic line to indicate the

boundary between the introductory section and the narrative itself (240). Naturally, the symbolic term "this paper" is not included in this version, and the pilgrimage narrative is instead described as a "sketch," presumably to link it with Otway's *Sketches in Ireland*; indeed, Carleton mentions this title a little later in the text (236). However, since Carleton himself is a pilgrim carrying out penitential practices in the pilgrimage story, he cannot be the impartial visitor-observer-narrator that Otway was in his letter. The difficulty Carleton faces is how to juggle his role as the objective presenter of a fictional story in which a young Irish Catholic visits St. Patrick's Purgatory with that of a storyteller describing his own pilgrimage experience. In the definitive version, following in the steps of Otway, Carleton starts his travelogue with factual and historical descriptions (relying on Otway's text) to present his pilgrimage story and removes the original harsh and provocative statements about Catholicism, making the final version a travelogue similar to Otway's. The title of "The Lough Derg Pilgrim" is certainly appropriate for a travelogue featuring the geographical site. The struggles Carleton went through to combine fact and fiction can be inferred from the many revisions he made over the years.

In the context of the present argument, one particular passage removed from the final version also suggests the change in the literary quality of the narrative. The passage concerns a young man Carleton saw falling from a gallery during his so-called "imprisonment" (260), the hardest part of the three-day penitential program he participated in, and in some ways similar to Raimundo Perellós's experiences in the cave. The young man died the next day. In the original version, Carleton describes the facial expression of the dead man to indicate the dreadful nature of the experience and establish a link with the general fear of purgatory, as the Viscount's description of purgatory did in Otway's travelogue. I will quote part of the passage here: "The under jaw of the corpse hung down, his eyes were open, and stared with the wild glasy [sic] look of death, his nostrils were distended and filled with mucus, his hair was on end, and about his brows and the upper part of his face, lay the froth of the perspiration which exuded in the agonies of death" (352). Originally, Carleton must have felt it necessary to describe the horror experienced by a naïve and devoted young Catholic to convey the absurdity of the practices carried out in the ritual of "imprisonment". However, he excludes this realistic and somewhat grotesque depiction of horror in the 1843 version to maintain harmony with the trend for less offensive writing. Thus, the religiously loaded purgatory vision of a medieval nobleman described in Otway's letter is transformed into the facial depiction of an ordinary young Catholic in Carleton's original version. Then, in the definitive edition, the remnants of the religio-historical visionary description of Purgatory are removed by Carleton, who

was fully conscious of the literary devices Otway used in his narrative.

This metamorphosis of this Purgatory passage certainly shows how flexible the category of travelogue is, but more significantly, it shows how Carleton controls the description of the visionary fear of the Purgatory, which is the essence of any pilgrimage to this religious site. Robert Easting remarks that the popularity of the archetypal *Tractatus de Purgatorio Sancti Patricii* owes much to "matter from a long tradition of vision literature with the actual, yet geographically remote, location of the purgatorial 'cave'" (xviii). The Purgatorial "vision" included in Otway's letter and the first version of Carleton's narrative functions as the key to forming the traditional framework of the St. Patrick's Purgatory legend. These two travelogues thus maintain a combination of fact and fiction, following in the medieval literary tradition. However, Carleton's final version casts this established framework aside and presents a new legend of St. Patrick's Purgatory in which, instead of a nobleman, a poor old Irish woman performs the vital role. On the way to Lough Derg, the naïve nineteen-year-old Carleton befriends this old woman together with another Irish-speaking old woman, both of whom take him for a priest and ask him to say a rosary for them, a request that he accepts. Later, after completing their penitential practices, all three stay overnight at the same inn. When Carleton wakes up the next morning, he finds he has been robbed of almost everything he had with him; he is later told that the old woman is a notorious local thief. Thus, Carleton's Purgatory story incorporates a totally different and amusing nightmare based on crude reality.

Unlike Otway, who featured stories about Finn and other Gaelic legends in his writing, Carleton relied on the Catholic communities he was familiar with to paint a picture of Ireland. Carleton could describe Irish peasants first-hand, which is something Otway could not do, however much he might have wanted to. In *Sketches*, Otway does not clearly indicate a wish to direct the attention of British readers to Irish life and culture. In contrast, Carleton directly addresses British readers in the Preface to the first volume of *Traits and Stories* (1830), published by William Curry, also Otway's publishers. Carleton suggests that he is resigned to the realities of Irish Catholics, but that at the same time he feels a tremendous attachment to them. He further adds: "His [the author's] desire is neither to distort his countrymen into demons, nor to enshrine them as suffering innocents and saints — but to exhibit them as they really are" (ix). This approach met the demands of British readers, and Carleton duly became an established fiction writer. However, he inevitably suffered from being viewed as a peasant writer. When the definitive edition of *Traits and Stories* was published, Carleton cried out: "I approached that difficult task with advantages of knowing them [the Irish peasantry], which perhaps few other Irish

writers ever possessed; *and this is the only merit which I claim*" (Introduction xvii). Otway, who pursued his Irishness by relating Gaelic hero-legends in his travelogue on Station Island, paved the way for Carleton, who, in sticking to the factual realities of the downtrodden added another layer of Irishness to the literary realm.

In *The Lonely Voice*, O'Connor points out that one significant condition of the short story is that it show "an attitude of mind that is attracted by submerged population groups, whatever these may be at any given time — tramps, artists, lonely idealists, dreamers, and spoiled priests," a condition that sets short stories apart from novels adhering to "the classical concept of civilized society" (20). He further insists that the short story should not deal with "the totality of a human life," but select "the point at which he [the writer] can approach it." He also mentions the importance of "a complete fiasco" in a short story (21). Although he did not refer to Carleton in this essay, the old-woman thief story in "The Lough Derg Pilgrim" satisfies all of these conditions. Employing the medieval literary framework of St. Patrick's Purgatory, Carleton developed his literary expertise to produce a story that led to the modern concept of the short story.

5. Conclusion

Stories of the pilgrimage to St. Patrick' Purgatory, which have been narrated since around 1200, have their archetype in a travelogue describing a journey to and from Station Island and the penitential practices carried out at the site. The most significant part of the practices is a visionary journey through the Purgatory, where pilgrims undergo various horrific and occasionally fatal experiences. Following this framework of factual journey followed by fictional vision, the Protestant Otway produced, as an objective narrator, a patchwork collection of past narratives about St. Patrick's Purgatory. This device is effective not only in adding an antiquarian tone to the narrative but also in expressing the author's critical and sarcastic attitudes toward this site of the Catholic faith. This contrasts with the way Otway relates the Finn legends, where his intention is to use this Gaelic hero to glorify Ireland. This pilgrimage-purgatory travelogue thus offers a space in which different locally connected types of narratives coexist.

Under the guidance of Otway, Carleton began his literary career by writing about his own pilgrimage to St. Patrick's Purgatory. This 1828 piece can be regarded as a religious commentary-cum-travelogue. However, the final version included in his 1843 *Traits and Stories*, designed as a tribute to Otway, incorporates part of Otway's patchwork narrative at the beginning. Thus, Carleton maintains Otway's travelogue

framework and, as an objective narrator, relates the story of a young Catholic's pilgrimage to Station Island. Carleton's travelogue no longer needed the Purgatory vision nor the heroic Finn: the real Irish peasants in front of him were a rich enough source for his factual fiction stories.

Komazawa University Received September 1, 2014

Works Cited

Blake Family, The. *Letters from the Irish Highlands of Connemara.* 1825. Clifden: Gibbons, 1995. Print.

Brand, Gordon, ed. *William Carleton: The Authentic Voice.* Gerrards Cross: Colin Smythe, 2006. Print. Irish Literary Studies 53.

Carleton, William. *Father Butler: The Lough Dearg Pilgrim.* 2nd ed. Dublin: Curry, 1839. *Google Book Search.* Web. 4 Nov. 2012.

———. Introduction. Carleton, *Traits and Stories,* 1990. ix–xxiv.

———. "The Lough Derg Pilgrim." Carleton, *Traits and Stories,* 1990. 236–70.

[———.] "A Pilgrimage to Patrick's Purgatory." *Christian Examiner and Church of Ireland Magazine,* 6 (April and May 1828): 268–86, 343–62. *Google Book Search.* Web. 4 Nov. 2012.

[———.] Preface. *Traits and Stories of the Irish Peasantry.* Vol. 1. Dublin: Curry, 1830. vii–xii. JPEG file.

———. *Traits and Stories of the Irish Peasantry.* Vol. 1. 1843. Gerrards Cross: Colin Smythe, 1990. Print.

[Croker, Thomas Crofton.] *Fairy Legends and Traditions of the South of Ireland.* 3 vols. London: Murray, 1825–28. *Internet Archive.* Web. 10 Aug. 2014.

———. *Researches in the South of Ireland.* 1824. New York: Barnes & Noble, 1969. Print.

D., B. "Original Communications and Authenticated Facts." *Roman Catholic Expositor, and Friend of Ireland* No. 1 & No. 1, suppl. (Feb. 1825): [2–3 & 1–2]. TIFF file.

Dunne, Tom. "Towards a National Art?: George Petrie's Two Versions of *The Last Circuit of Pilgrims of Clonmacnoise.*" *A Shared Legacy: Essays on Irish and Scottish Art and Visual Culture.* Ed. Fintan Cullen and John Morrison. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2005. 79–96. Print.

Easting, Robert, ed. *St Patrick's Purgatory: Two Versions of* Owayne Miles *and* The Vision of William of Stranton *Together with the Long Text of the* Tractatus de Purgatorio Sancti Patricii. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1991. Print. Early English Text Society 298.

Hayley, Barbara. *Carleton's* Traits and Stories *and the 19th Century Anglo-Irish Tradition.* Gerrards Cross: Colin Smythe, 1983. Irish Literary Studies 12. Print.

Hooper, Glenn. *Travel Writing and Ireland, 1760–1860.* Basingstoke: Palgrave-Macmillan, 2005. Print.

Ingman, Heather. *A History of the Irish Short Story.* Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2009. Print.

Jones, Henry. *Saint Patricks Purgatory: Containing the Description, Originall, Progresse, and Demolition of that Superstitious Place*. London: Royston, 1647. Microform. *Early English Books 1641–1700*. Ann Arbor: U Microfilms International, [1983–]. Real 211.

Keating, Geoffrey. *The General History of Ireland*. Trans. Dermod O'Connor. London: Creake, 1723. *ECCO*. Web.

Killick, Tim. *British Short Fiction in the Early Nineteenth Century: The Rise of the Tale*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008. Print.

Le Goff, Jacques. *The Birth of Purgatory*. Trans. Arthur Goldhammer. Chicago: U of Chicago P, 1984. Print.

Leerssen, Joep. *Mere Irish and Fíor-Ghael: Studies in the Idea of Irish Nationality, Its Development and Literary Expression Prior to the Nineteenth Century*. Notre Dame: U of Notre Dame P, 1997. Print.

Mac an Bhaird, Alan, trans. "The Journey of Viscount Ramon de Perellós to Saint Patrick's Purgatory." By Ramón de Perellós. *CELT: Corpus of Electronic Texts*. U College Cork. 2012. Web. 1 Nov. 2012. <http://www.ucc.ie/celt/published/T100079A/>.

MacKillop, James. *Fionn mac Cumhaill: Celtic Myth in English Literature*. Syracuse: Syracuse UP, 1986. Print.

Malcolm, Cheryl Alexander, and David Malcolm, eds. *A Companion to the British and Irish Short Story*. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2008. Print.

Matsuda, Takami. *Death and Purgatory in Middle English Didactic Poetry*. Cambridge: Brewer, 1997. Print.

[Maurice, F. D.?] "National Tales of Ireland." *Westminster Review* 9 (1828): 422–40. *Google Book Search*. Web. 25 July 2010.

[Moore, Thomas.] "Irish Novels." *Edinburgh Review, or Critical Journal* 43 (1826): 356–72. *Google Book Search*. Web. 12 Apr. 2011.

[Morgan, T. C.?] "Immigration of Irish Authors." *New Monthly Magazine and Literary Journal* 23 (1828): 140–45. *Google Book Search*. Web. 12 Apr. 2011.

Nakamura, Tetsuko. "'Irish' Quest in Catholic-Oriented Novels of the 1820s and 1830s: The Banim Brothers and William Carleton." *Journal of Irish Studies* 26 (2011): 38–51. Print.

O'Connor, Frank. *The Lonely Voice: A Study of the Short Story*. 1962. Hoboken: Melville House, 2004. Print.

Ó Gallchoir, Clíona. "Celtic Ireland and Celtic Scotland: Ossianism and *The Wild Irish Girl*." *Scotland, Ireland, and the Romantic Aesthetic*. Ed. David Duff and Catherine Jones. Lewisburg: Bucknell UP, 2007. 114–30. Print.

O'Halloran, Clare. "Historical Writing, 1690–1890." *The Cambridge History of Irish Literature*. Ed. Margaret Kelleher and Phillip O'Leary. Vol. 1. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2006. 599–632. Print.

Orel, Harold. *The Victorian Short Story: Development and Triumph of a Literary Genre*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1986. Print.

O'Sullevano Bearro, D. Philippo [O'Sullivan-Beare, Philip]. *Historiae Catholicae Iberniae*

Compendium. Ulyssippone [Lisbon]: Excusum à Petro Crasbeeckio, 1621. *HathiTrust Digital Library*. Web. 10 Aug. 2014.

———. *Historiae Catholicae Iberniae Compendium*. Ed. Matthew Kelly. Dublin: O'Daly, 1850. *Internet Archive*. Web. 10 Aug. 2014.

[Otway, Caesar.] "Caesar Otway on William Carleton." Brand 17–28.

[———.] *Sketches in Ireland: Descriptive of Interesting, and Hitherto Unnoticed Districts, in the North and South*. Dublin: Curry, 1827. *Google Book Search*. Web. 3 Nov. 2012.

Skeffington, Sean. "Carleton and Lough Derg." Brand 166–83.

Trumpener, Katie. *Bardic Nationalism: The Romantic Novel and the British Empire*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1997. Print.

Turner, Victor, and Edith Turner. *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture*. New York: Columbia UP, 1978. Print.

Wentz, W. Y. Evans. *The Fairy-Faith in Celtic Countries*. 1911. New York: Lemma, 1973. Print.